

**MINUTES
CITY COUNCIL REGULAR MEETING
CITY OF MONTEREY
Tuesday, June 20, 2023
4:00 PM 7:00 PM
COUNCIL CHAMBER
MONTEREY, CALIFORNIA**

Councilmembers

Present: Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Smith, Williamson
Absent: None

City Staff

Present: City Manager, Assistant City Manager, Assistant City Attorney, Community Development Director, Recording Secretary, Senior Associate Planner, Associate Planner, Lieutenant, Senior Engineer, Intern

*****Afternoon Session Agenda *****

CALL TO ORDER

Mayor Williamson called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m. Recording Secretary Cleary called the roll as highlighted above and explained to the public how to participate in the meeting virtually.

PUBLIC COMMENTS (MATTERS NOT ON AGENDA)

Public comment on non-agendized matters was received from: Steve Lightfoot, Jenny Catnack, Rick Johnson, Jody Emerson, and Gregg.

CONSENT ITEMS

No public comments were provided regarding the Consent Agenda items, and no items were pulled from the Consent Agenda for discussion.

On a motion by Councilmember Smith, seconded by Councilmember Garcia, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council approved the CONSENT ITEMS:

AYES: 5 COUNCILMEMBERS: Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Smith, Williamson
NOES: 0 COUNCILMEMBERS: (None)
ABSENT: 0 COUNCILMEMBERS: (None)
ABSTAIN: 0 COUNCILMEMBERS: (None)
RECUSED: 0 COUNCILMEMBERS: (None)

Approval of Minutes

1. June 6, 2023 Regular Meeting (Not a project under CEQA per Article 20 Section 15378 and under General Rule Article 5 Section 15061)

Action: *Approved as submitted*

City Council Minutes

Ordinances

- 2. 1st Reading by Title Only of an Ordinance to Amend Chapter 25, Section 12.04(b) of Monterey City Code, "Holidays Observed," to add the Juneteenth Holiday (Not a project under CEQA per Article 20 Section 15378 and under General Rule Article 5 Section 15061)
Action: Introduced by title only; Waived full reading; Passed Ordinance to print

Resolutions

- 3. Accept Grant of Easement from the United States of America for Storm Drainage Infrastructure Purposes over Portion of the Land at U.S. Navy Naval Postgraduate School (APN 013-011-003-000) in Monterey, CA, and Authorize the Mayor to Sign the Grant of Easement (Not a Project under CEQA per Article 20, Section 15378 and under General Rule Article 5, Section 15061 and Record of NEPA Categorical Exclusion Prepared per 32 CFR 775.6(f)(30))
Action: Adopted Resolution No. 23-070 C.S.

Other

- 4. Authorize the Mayor to Sign a Letter on Behalf of the City Council Supporting the Application by the Transportation Agency for Monterey County to the United States Department of Transportation (USDOT) Safe Streets for All Discretionary Grant Opportunity for Fiscal Year 2023 for the Monterey County Regional Vision Zero Action Plan (Not a Project Under CEQA per Article 20, Section 15378 and Under General Rule Article 5, Section 15061)
Action: Authorized Mayor Williamson to sign the letter
- 5. Recognize City Employees for Milestone Anniversaries and Retirements for 2nd Quarter 2023 (Not a project under CEQA Article 20, Section 15378 and under General Rule Article 5, Section 15061)
Action: Recognized employees

City Manager Uslar recognized City employees for milestone anniversaries and retirements.

***** End of Consent Agenda *****

Adjourn to Ocean View Community Services District Meeting: Consent Agenda

The Council adjourned to the Ocean View Community Services District meeting at 4:22 p.m.

- 6. Receive Ocean View Community Services District Quarterly Report (Not a Project under CEQA per Article 20, Section 15378 and General Rule Article 5, Section 15061)
Action: Received report

There were no public comments on this item.

Adjourn to City Council Meeting

The Ocean View Community Services District board adjourned to the City Council Regular meeting.

City Council Minutes

PUBLIC APPEARANCE

7. Receive a Report and City Council Feedback on the May 30, 2023 Rental Inventory Monterey Town Hall Meeting (Not a Project under CEQA per Article 20, Section 15378 and under General Rule Article 5, Section 15061)

Action: Received report; Provided feedback; Received public comments

Community Development Director Cole gave the staff presentation.

Councilmember Garcia, Councilmember Barber, Councilmember Haffa, and Mayor Williamson announced that they had attended the event; Councilmember Smith said he did not attend but watched the recording afterward.

The City Council spoke highly of the public input received through the May 30, 2023 Rental Inventory Monterey Town Hall Meeting, highlighted points of interest, shared ideas for improvement, and voiced concerns relevant to the matter.

Public comment was received from: Loren Samuels, who spoke against Rental Inventory implementation; Adam Pinterits, who asserted that more public outreach and input are needed; Kathy Anderson, who suggested a Rental Inventory would be unfair; Kevin Dayton, who argued against the Rental Inventory and advocated for maintaining privacy; Young Seon, who asked clarifying questions regarding the Rental Inventory; Jeff Davi, who argued against the Rental Inventory; Nelson Vega, who suggested the issue should be addressed privately and without Council involvement; Sherna Stewart, who provided potential solutions; Esther Malkin, who said the Town Hall's attendance was disproportionate between renters and property owners and advocated for homelessness prevention; Lori Mazzuca, who provided suggestions for future improvement; and Graziella Cardinalli, who alleged the burden of a Rental Inventory falls to property owners over renters.

In the interest of timing, Mayor Williamson forewent Councilmember Comments.

8. Receive Monterey One Water (M1W) Presentation and City of Monterey Staff Report Regarding M1W Billing Change Proposal (Not a Project Under CEQA per Article 20, Section 15378 and Under General Rule Article 5, Section 15061)

Action: Received presentation

City Manager Uslar introduced Paul Sciuto, of Monterey One Water, who gave Monterey One Water's presentation and answered Councilmembers' questions regarding the fee, revenue structures, fiscal impacts and responsibilities, and financial processes involved

City Manager Uslar introduced Intern Kennedy, who presented the staff report.

Mr. Sciuto added further information regarding the matter.

In the interest of time, Mayor Williamson shortened the public comment allotment from three minutes to two minutes each.

Public comment was received from: Esther Malkin, who expressed gratitude for the item's presentation and consideration; Lori Mazzuca, who said she had not received anything regarding this change; and Graziella Cardinalli, who shared concerns for rising fees.

Mayor Williamson supplied a response regarding the presented comments.

City Council Minutes

PUBLIC HEARING

- 9. Adopting a Resolution Establishing Objective Design Standards for the Downtown and Lighthouse Specific Plans and Amending the Plans to Clarify Visitor Accommodation Facility District Requirements, Adding Massage Establishment Requirements and Definition, Adding Fence and Wall Requirements, Adding Makerspace Use Classification and Definition, Clarifying Residential Minor and Major (First Floor; Four Units or More) Requirements, Adding New Subdivision Minimum Lot Size and Width Requirements, Updating Streetscape Lighting Requirements, and Amending the Utility-Major Definition to Include Water Facilities (Exempt from CEQA Article 19, Section 15305, Class 5)
Action: Continued to July 18, 2023 at the 4:00 p.m. session.

Mayor Williamson announced that in the interest of time, item 9 would be considered for continuance. The Council unanimously agreed.

On a motion by Mayor Williamson, seconded by Councilmember Haffa, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council continued the item to July 18, 2023 at the 4:00 p.m. session:

AYES:	5	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Smith, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)

- 10. Levy Assessments to Fund the North Fremont, New Monterey, and Cannery Row Business Improvement Districts (Not a Project Under CEQA per Article 20, Section 15378 and Under General Rule Article 5, Section 15061)
Action: Continued to evening session; Conducted public hearing; Adopted Resolution Nos. 23-071, 23-072, and 23-073 C.S.

Mayor Williamson announced that in the interest of time, item 10 was recommended for continuance to the evening session. The Council unanimously voted to support the continuance as recommended.

On a motion by Mayor Williamson, seconded by Councilmember Garcia, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council continued the matter to the evening session:

AYES:	5	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Smith, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)

The item was then taken up at 10:46 p.m., following Item 11 and preceding Item 12.

Community Development Director Cole gave the staff presentation and confirmed there were no protest votes from any of the businesses in the districts.

No public comments were received.

City Council Minutes

On a motion by Councilmember Smith, seconded by Councilmember Haffa, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council adopted Resolution Nos. 23-071, 23-072, and 23-073 C.S.:

AYES:	5	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Smith, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)

RECESS

The Council recessed at 5:57 p.m.

RECONVENE

The Council reconvened at 7:00 p.m., with the full Council present.

***** Evening Session Agenda *****

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Mayor Williamson led the Pledge.

CONTINUED PUBLIC COMMENTS (MATTERS NOT ON AGENDA)

Public comment on non-agendized matters was received from: Dan Presser, Char Carter, Lorna Moffatt, Luis Osorio, an unidentified person, and Brian Rosen.

Adjourn to Joint Special Meeting and Establish Quorum of the Planning Commission

The Council was joined by the Planning Commission and adjourned to the Joint Special Meeting at 7:19 p.m.

Recording Secretary Cleary called the roll of the City Council and the Planning Commission, with the following members present: Councilmember Barber, Councilmember Garcia, Councilmember Haffa, Councilmember Smith, Mayor Williamson, Chair Fletcher, Vice Chair Bluth, Commissioner Brassfield, Commissioner Dawson, Commissioner Latasa, Commissioner Silva, Commissioner Freeman, thus establishing that a quorum was in attendance for both the City Council and the Planning Commission.

JOINT SPECIAL MEETING: CITY COUNCIL AND PLANNING COMMISSION

- 11. Receive Report on the Community Survey Report Results, Preliminary Housing Opportunity Sites, and Strategies to Facilitate Production of the City’s Regional Share of Housing for the Draft Monterey 2031 General Plan Update (Not a Project Under CEQA per Article 20, Section 15378 and Under General Rule Article 5, Section 15061)

Action: Received report

City Manager Uslar introduced item 11 and briefly described the progress made concerning the matter. Associate Planner Sabdo introduced Consultant Andrew Hill, who gave the staff presentation and answered Councilmember and Commissioner questions, including questions

City Council Minutes

regarding deadlines and regulations, location feasibility, proposed versus existing conditions, the scoring and assessment process, and potentially changing the buffer.

Public comment was received from: Kevin Dayton, who listed potential solutions to increase the number of housing units within the City; Luis Osorio, who urged the Council to take action as the issue spans nationwide; P.K. Diffenbaugh, who said School District staff and students struggle with housing and suggested ways to increase employee and middle-income housing; Nelson Vega, who expressed frustrations with constraints from existing City processes; an unidentified person, who advocated for a stronger Police presence and asked if the Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) requirements had been challenged; Tom Rowley, who spoke of lost opportunities and the unaddressed job-housing balance; Lorna Moffat, who advised suing the Governor, placing a moratorium on all future building, and utilizing vacant hotel rooms and buildings for housing; Tom Reeves, who commented on traffic gridlock and suggested opportunity sites to consider; Esther Malkin, who suggested some of the provided information may be incomprehensible to some members of the general public; Richard Ruccello, who described challenges faced in developing and funding housing or increasing residential density in high-traffic areas; Robert Yoha, who brought up issues presented by the low water availability and potential for losing local services such as grocery stores; Diane Coward, who echoed previous comments regarding the need for housing and obstacles hindering the ability to provide more; and Tammy Jennings, who agreed with the suggestion to challenge the Governor on this requirement.

The City Council and Planning Commission discussed the matter. Mr. Hill answered questions while describing further details regarding the project's considerations, analyses, goals, procedures, strategies, and challenges. Suggestions and cautions were voiced to help improve feasibility and affordability in attempt to increase housing development opportunities within the City. Main points of interest included Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs), Junior Accessory Dwelling Units (JADUs), promotion of incentives, proposed and potential development sites, support for locals and the existing workforce, transportation and parking issues, potentials for rezoning, quality of life, streamlining processes, Area Median Income (AMI), funding and subsidizing costs, environmental constraints such as extreme lack of water and eminent sea level rise, the needs to partner with private sector developers and increase the buffer, streamlining permit approvals, and increasing density.

Adjourn to City Council Meeting

At 10:34 p.m., the Joint Special Meeting adjourned and the Council adjourned back to the City Council Regular meeting.

The Council then recessed at 10:34 p.m. and reconvened at 10:42 p.m. with the full Council present.

PUBLIC APPEARANCE (EVE)

12. Select Preliminary Housing Opportunity Sites and Strategies to Facilitate Production of the City's Regional Share of Housing for the Draft Monterey 2031 General Plan Update (Not a Project Under CEQA per Article 20, Section 15378 and Under General Rule Article 5, Section 15061)

Action: *Approved opportunity sites as follows:*

- ***81/85 Via Robles, 1300 Munras Avenue, and 1262 Munras Avenue (4-0-1, Councilmember Smith recused);***
- ***150 Mar Vista Drive (4-0-1, Councilmember Haffa recused);***
- ***Del Monte Shopping Center (4-0-1, Councilmember Smith recused);***

City Council Minutes

- **Maps 1-2 and Maps 5-9 excepting the items that Councilmembers Smith and Haffa had recused from (5-0);**
- **Map 3 with increased density in the 50-acre site at the bottom right corner of the map (5-0);**
- **Map 4 excluding the Andronico's site (4-1, Councilmember Smith voting no)**

City Manager Uslar stated that the item could be continued to a date certain of June 28, 2023 if the Council preferred, then discussed logistics of continuing the hearing.

On a motion by Councilmember Haffa, seconded by Councilmember Barber, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council extended the meeting to 11:30 p.m., and determined it would discuss the continued item 10, then the matter of Item 12:

AYES:	5	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Smith, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)

Item 10 was then briefly taken up at 10:46 p.m., after which the Council took up the matter of Item 12 at 10:49 p.m.

With the Planning Commission no longer present, the City Council deliberated and discussed each of the Opportunity Site Maps included in Attachment 2 of Item 11 in the published Agenda Packet.

Mayor Williamson and Assistant City Attorney Salameh identified that Councilmember Smith would recuse from the following sites, listed in Map 5: 81/85 Via Robles, 1300 Munras Avenue, and 1262 Munras Avenue.

Councilmember Smith left the Chamber at 10:51 p.m.

The Council discussed the matters on which Councilmember Smith had recused.

There were no public comments provided regarding the matters from which Councilmember Smith had recused.

On a motion by Mayor Williamson, seconded by Councilmember Haffa, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council approved Councilmember Smith's abstention sites, 81/85 Via Robles, 1300 Munras Avenue, and 1262 Munras Avenue:

AYES:	4	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	1	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Smith

Assistant City Attorney Salameh announced that Councilmember Haffa would recuse from voting on the matter of 150 Mar Vista Drive.

Councilmember Haffa left the Chamber at 10:54 p.m., and Councilmember Smith returned at the same time.

City Council Minutes

The Council then discussed the matter in which Councilmember Haffa had recused.

There were no public comments provided regarding the matters from which Councilmember Haffa recused.

On a motion by Councilmember Barber, seconded by Councilmember Smith, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council approved Councilmember Haffa's abstention site, 150 Mar Vista Drive:

AYES:	4	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Smith, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	1	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Haffa

Councilmember Haffa returned to the Council Chamber at 10:57 p.m.

The Council discussed each site that no Councilmembers had recused from, asking clarifying questions about specific locations and making relevant suggestions for consideration and deliberation. Community Development Director Cole and Consultant Andrew Hill provided answers and insight. The Council spoke in support of development on School District sites to provide housing for District employees, expressed differing concerns regarding the area at Garden Road and Highway 68, and spoke against utilizing the Andronico's site.

On a motion by Mayor Williamson, seconded by Councilmember Haffa, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council extended the meeting to 11:45 p.m.:

AYES:	4	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Williamson
NOES:	1	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Smith
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)

Assistant City Attorney Salameh announced that the sites Councilmember Smith had previously recused from had been removed from the slides and were not being discussed at the time.

Councilmember Smith recused from discussing the Del Monte Shopping Center site and left the Council Chamber at 11:34 p.m.

There were no public comments presented on the matter.

On a motion by Councilmember Haffa, seconded by Councilmember Barber, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council approved Councilmember Smith's abstention site, the Del Monte Shopping Center:

AYES:	4	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	1	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Smith

Councilmember Smith returned to the Chamber at 11:36 p.m., and the Council continued reviewing the proposed sites.

City Council Minutes

Public comment was received from: Tammy Jennings, who advocated for leaving the Safeway site as-is; Diane Coward who spoke in favor of utilizing school sites for employee housing, upzoning the Cass Street area, and utilizing the Del Monte Shopping Center site.

On a motion by Mayor Williamson, seconded by Councilmember Haffa, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council approved Maps 1-2 and Maps 5-9, excepting the items that Councilmembers Smith and Haffa had recused from:

AYES:	5	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Smith, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)

The Council asked clarifying questions regarding the sites in Map 3. Community Development Director Cole and Mr. Hill provided information. Concerns were shared regarding increased density along the highway.

On a motion by Councilmember Haffa, seconded by Councilmember Garcia, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council approved Map 3 with increased density in the 50-acre site at the bottom right corner of the map:

AYES:	5	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Smith, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)

On a motion by Mayor Williamson, seconded by Councilmember Haffa, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council extended the meeting until midnight:

AYES:	5	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Smith, Williamson
NOES:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)

Mayor Williamson introduced a motion to approve Map 4 as presented.

Councilmember Barber disagreed because the map included the Andronico's grocery store.

The motion failed for lack of a seconder.

Councilmember Haffa introduced a substitute motion to approve Map 4 excluding the Andronico's site. Mayor Williamson seconded the substitute motion.

City Manager Uslar explained that Andronico's lies in both Monterey and Pacific Grove.

Councilmember Haffa amended the substitute motion to also exempt the Carl's Jr. portion of the site. The motion's seconder did not agree with the amendment and withdrew his second. The amended substitute motion failed for lack of a seconder.

City Council Minutes

On a new motion by Mayor Williamson, seconded by Councilmember Garcia, and carried by the following vote, which was conducted by voice, the City Council approved Map 4, excluding the Andronico's site:

AYES:	4	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Barber, Garcia, Haffa, Williamson
NOES:	1	COUNCILMEMBERS:	Smith
ABSENT:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
ABSTAIN:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)
RECUSED:	0	COUNCILMEMBERS:	(None)

COUNCIL COMMENTS

The City Council had no further comments.

CITY MANAGER REPORTS


City Manager Usler provided no further comments.


ADJOURNMENT

The Council adjourned at 11:52 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Approved,

DocuSigned by:

93B4D4E6F055451...

DocuSigned by:

1B38B5C4EE3E4F6...

Jennifer Cleary
Recording Secretary

Tyller Williamson
Mayor